

Asking for the solutions of 6 out of the following 7 problems.

1. Decide if functions  $f_n(x) = e^{-|x - \frac{1}{n}|n^2}$  (a) converge on  $\mathbb{R}$  pointwise, (b) converge on  $\mathbb{R}$  uniformly.

**Solution.** For any  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , we have  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |x - \frac{1}{n}| = x$ , thus  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |x - \frac{1}{n}|n^2 = \infty$  if  $x \neq 0$ ; for  $x = 0$ , we have  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} |x - \frac{1}{n}|n^2 = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n}n^2 = \infty$  also. Thus, in any case,  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(x) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} e^{-|x - \frac{1}{n}|n^2} = 0$  for all  $x$ , and  $f_n \rightarrow 0$  pointwise. Convergence is not uniform on  $\mathbb{R}$ , because  $\sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} |f_n(x) - 0| \geq f_n(\frac{1}{n}) = 1 \not\rightarrow 0$ .

2. Decide if the function  $f(x, y) = \frac{\sin xy}{x^2 + y^2}$  can be continuously extended to all of  $\mathbb{R}^2$ .

**Solution.** The function  $f(x, y)$  is continuous except at the point  $(0, 0)$ , where it is not defined, thus the answer will be positive if and only if  $\lim_{(x, y) \rightarrow (0, 0)} f(x, y)$  exists, then we can define  $f(0, 0)$  as its value. If this limit exists, then it equals to the limit along any line,  $\lim_{\substack{(x, y) \rightarrow (0, 0) \\ (x, y) = t(a, b)}} f(x, y)$  for any  $(a, b) \neq (0, 0)$ . But

$$\lim_{\substack{(x, y) \rightarrow (0, 0) \\ (x, y) = t(0, 1)}} f(x, y) = \lim_{y \rightarrow 0} f(0, y) = 0$$

while

$$\lim_{\substack{(x, y) \rightarrow (0, 0) \\ (x, y) = t(1, 1)}} f(x, y) = \lim_{t \rightarrow 0} f(t, t) = \lim_{t \rightarrow 0} \frac{\sin t^2}{t^2 + t^2} = \frac{1}{2} \neq 0.$$

Thus,  $\lim_{(x, y) \rightarrow (0, 0)} f(x, y)$  does not exist, and continuous extension of  $f$  on all of  $\mathbb{R}^2$  is not possible.

3. Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space.

- (a) Prove that  $d$  is a continuous real-valued function on the product metric space  $(X \times X, d_{X \times X})$  where  $d_{X \times X}$  is a natural product metric induced by  $d$ .
- (b) Give an example of  $(X, d)$  and complete non-empty subsets  $A, B \subset X$  such that there do not exist  $a_0 \in A$  and  $b_0 \in B$  such that

$$d(a_0, b_0) = \inf\{d(a, b) : a \in A, b \in B\}$$

**Solution.**

- (a) Estimate

$$\begin{aligned} d(x_1, y_1) - d(x_2, y_2) &= d(x_1, y_1) - d(x_2, y_1) + d(x_2, y_1) - d(x_2, y_2) \\ &\leq d(x_1, x_2) + d(y_1, y_2) \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

because

$$\begin{aligned}d(x_2, y_1) &\leq d(x_2, x_1) + d(x_1, y_1) \\d(x_2, y_1) - d(x_1, y_1) &\leq d(x_2, x_1)\end{aligned}$$

and, exchanging the roles of  $x$  and  $y$  and using symmetry of metric,

$$d(x_2, y_1) - d(x_2, y_2) \leq d(y_1, y_2).$$

Swapping  $(x_1, y_1)$  and  $(x_2, y_2)$  in (1), we have also

$$d(x_2, y_2) - d(x_1, y_1) \leq d(x_1, x_2) + d(y_1, y_2),$$

thus

$$\begin{aligned}|d(x_1, y_1) - d(x_2, y_2)| &\leq d(x_1, x_2) + d(y_1, y_2) \\&= d_{X \times X}((x_1, x_2), (y_1, y_2)).\end{aligned}$$

(b) Consider  $X = \mathbb{R}^2$  equipped with the euclidean metric

$$d((s, t), (u, v)) = \sqrt{|s - u|^2 + |t - v|^2}.$$

Define  $A = \{(s, 0) \in C\}$  and  $B = \{(s, \frac{1}{s}) \in C\}$ , where  $C = \{(s, t) : s \geq 1\}$ . The set  $C$  is closed, thus complete subset of  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , and its subsets  $A$  and  $B$  are also closed and thus complete, because they are inverse images under continuous mappings of closed sets,

$$A = f^{-1}(\{0\}), \quad f : (s, t) \mapsto t$$

and

$$B = g^{-1}(\{1\}) \quad g : (s, t) \mapsto st.$$

We have

$$\inf\{d(a, b) : a \in A, b \in B\} \leq d\left((s, 0), \left(s, \frac{1}{s}\right)\right) = \frac{1}{s}$$

for all  $s \geq 1$ , thus

$$\inf\{d(a, b) : a \in A, b \in B\} = 0.$$

But  $A \cap B = \emptyset$ , so there do not exist  $a_0 \in A$  and  $b_0 \in B$  such that

$$d(a_0, b_0) = 0$$

which would require  $a_0 = b_0$ .

4. We say that two metrics  $d_1$  and  $d_2$  defined on the same space  $X$  are equivalent if there exists real numbers  $c_1 > 0$  and  $c_2 > 0$  such that for every  $x, y \in X$ ,

$$c_1 d_1(x, y) \leq d_2(x, y) \leq c_2 d_1(x, y).$$

- (a) Prove that if  $d_1$  and  $d_2$  are equivalent metrics, then a sequence  $(x_n) \subset X$  converges to  $x$  in  $(X, d_2)$  if and only if  $(x_n) \subset X$  converges to  $x$  in  $(X, d_1)$ .

- (b) Let  $C([0, 1])$  denote the space of all continuous real-valued functions on  $[0, 1]$ . For any  $f, g \in C([0, 1])$ , let  $d_I$  denote the *integral* metric defined by

$$d_I(f, g) = \int_0^1 |f(x) - g(x)| dx,$$

and  $d_S$  denote the *supremum* metric defined by

$$d_S(f, g) = \sup_{x \in [0, 1]} |f(x) - g(x)|.$$

Prove that the metrics  $d_I$  and  $d_S$  are *not* equivalent.

**Solution.**

- (a) Suppose  $x_n \rightarrow x$  in  $(X, d_1)$ , or equivalently,  $d_1(x_n, x) \rightarrow 0$ . Then

$$0 \leq d_2(x_n, x) \leq c_2 d_1(x_n, x) \rightarrow 0$$

so  $d_2(x_n, x) \rightarrow 0$  by the squeeze theorem. Suppose that  $x_n \rightarrow x$  in  $(X, d_2)$ , then

$$0 \leq d_1(x_n, x) \leq \frac{1}{c_1} d_2(x_n, x) \rightarrow 0$$

and so  $d_1(x_n, x) \rightarrow 0$  by the squeeze theorem.

- (b) Choose  $f(x) = 0$  for all  $x$  and, for  $n \geq 2$ ,  $f_n(x)$  piecewise linear given by the values

$$f_n(0) = 0, \quad f_n\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) = 1, \quad f_n\left(\frac{2}{n}\right) = 0, \quad f_n(1) = 0.$$

Then,

$$d_I(f_n, f) = \int_0^1 |f_n(x)| dx = \frac{1}{n} \rightarrow \infty$$

while

$$d_S(f_n, f) = \sup_{x \in [0, 1]} |f_n(x)| = 1$$

By part 4a, the metrics  $d_I$  and  $d_S$  are not equivalent because  $f_n \rightarrow f$  in  $d_I$  but not in  $d_S$ .

5. Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be a bounded subset of  $C([a, b])$  with the supremum metric and

$$A = \left\{ F(x) = \int_a^x f(t) dt : f \in \mathcal{F} \right\}.$$

Prove that the closure  $\overline{A}$  of  $A$  is a compact subset of  $C([a, b])$ .

**Solution.** Since  $\mathcal{F}$  is bounded, there is  $M$  such that for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$  and all  $x \in [a, b]$ , it holds that  $|f(x)| \leq M$ . Let a sequence  $\{U_n\} \subset \overline{A}$ . Then, for every  $n$ , there exists  $F_n \in A$  such that  $d(U_n, F_n) < \frac{1}{n}$ , and  $F_n(x) = \int_a^x f_n(t) dt : f_n \in \mathcal{F}$ . For any  $x \in [a, b]$ , it holds that

$$|F_n(x)| = \left| \int_a^x f_n(t) dt \right| \leq (b-a)M,$$

thus  $\{F_n\}$  is uniformly bounded. Similarly, for any  $x, y \in [a, b]$ , it holds that

$$|F_n(x) - F_n(y)| = \left| \int_x^y f_n(t) dt \right| \leq |x - y| M,$$

thus the set  $\{F_n\}$  is equicontinuous. Since  $[a, b]$  is compact, by the Arzèla-Ascoli theorem, there exists a subsequence  $\{F_{n_k}\}$  that is uniformly convergent, that is, for some  $F \in C([a, b])$ ,  $d(F_{n_k}, F) \rightarrow 0$  as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ . By the triangle inequality,

$$d(U_{n_k}, F) \leq d(U_{n_k}, F_{n_k}) + d(F_{n_k}, F) \rightarrow 0.$$

Since the closure of a set is closed,  $F \in \overline{A}$ . Thus, any sequence in  $\overline{A}$  has a subsequence convergent in  $\overline{A}$ , so  $\overline{A}$  is compact.

6. Let  $(X, d)$  be a complete metric space, and  $A \subset X$ , equipped with the distance function  $d$  restricted to  $A \times A$ , denoted by  $d_A$ . Prove that the space  $(A, d_A)$  is complete if and only if  $A$  is closed in  $(X, d)$ .

**Solution.** Suppose  $(A, d_A)$  is complete. Let  $\{x_n\} \subset A$  converge to  $x$  in  $X$ . Then  $\{x_n\}$  is Cauchy in  $A$ , consequently Cauchy in  $X$ . Since  $X$  is complete, there exists a limit  $y$ ,  $x_n \rightarrow y$  in  $X$ . Since limit is unique,  $y = x$ . Thus  $A$  is closed subset of  $X$ .

Suppose  $A$  is closed in  $X$ . Let  $\{x_n\} \subset A$  be Cauchy  $(A, d_A)$ . Then  $\{x_n\}$  is Cauchy  $(X, d)$ , and since  $X$  is complete, there is a limit  $x$ ,  $x_n \rightarrow x$  in  $X$ . Since  $A$  is closed,  $x \in A$ . Since  $d$  and  $d_A$  coincide on  $A$ ,  $x_n \rightarrow x$  in  $X$  and  $x \in A$  imply  $x_n \rightarrow x$  in  $A$ .

7. Consider the power series  $f(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$

- (a) (5 points) Decide for which real numbers  $x$  the series converges.  
 (b) (15 points) Decide on which intervals the series converges uniformly.

Solution.

- (a) Since  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \left(\frac{1}{n}\right)^{1/n} = 1$ , the radius of convergence is  $R = \frac{1}{1}$ . That is, the series converges absolutely for all  $-1 < x < 1$  and diverges for all  $x < -1$  and  $x > 1$ . For  $x = 1$ , the series diverges, because  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$  is the harmonic series, which is known to be divergent. For  $x = -1$ , the series converges, because  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^n}{n}$  is of the form  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n a_n$  with  $a_n = \frac{1}{n} \searrow 0$ , which converges by the alternating series theorem.  
 (b) (5 points) Since power series at 0 converges uniformly on every interval  $[-a, a]$ ,  $a < R$ , the series converges uniformly on all intervals  $[-a, a]$ ,  $a < 1$ .

It remains to consider the uniform convergence near the endpoints.

- (5 points) Convergence of the series is not uniform on any interval  $(a, 1)$ ,  $a > 0$ : If convergence were uniform, there would exist  $N$  such that the partial sum  $s_N(x) = \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{x^n}{n}$

satisfies  $|f(x) - s_N(x)| < 1$  for all  $x \in (a, 1)$ . But  $s_N(x)$  is a polynomial, thus a bounded function, while

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow 1^-} f(x) \geq \lim_{x \rightarrow 1^-} s_m(x) = \sum_{n=1}^m \frac{1}{n} \rightarrow \infty \text{ as } m \rightarrow \infty,$$

thus  $f$  is not bounded on  $(a, 1)$ , contradiction.

(5 points) Convergence of the series is uniform on the interval  $[-1, 0]$ : Since, for a fixed  $x \in [-1, 0]$ , the sum  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  is alternating series with monotonically decreasing absolute values of its terms, we have

$$s_{2k-1}(x) \leq f(x) \leq s_{2k}(x), \quad s_{2k}(x) - s_{2k-1}(x) \leq \frac{1}{2k}$$

thus

$$|s_m(x) - f(x)| \leq \frac{1}{m}$$

for all  $m$  and all  $x \in [-1, 0]$ , which proves uniform convergence on  $[-1, 0]$ .

In conclusion, convergence of the power series is uniform on all intervals  $[-1, a)$ ,  $a < 1$ , but not on any interval with end point 1.

**Coverage and syllabus check by problem number:**

1. uniform convergence Rudin ch. 7
2. multivariate continuity ch. 9; version of problem 9.6, standard undergraduate real 2 (or calculus)
3. definition of infimum (ch. 1), definition compactness (ch. 2)
4. straightforward by definition of convergence in metric space (ch. 2)
5. Arzela-Ascoli theorem, sequentially compact (ch. 7, exercise 2.26)
6. complete metric space (ch. 2)
7. power series, radius of convergence, uniform convergence, alternating series. This is a version of the standard capstone problem of power series, which involves computing the sum of the series by differentiation or integration and Abel's theorem.

Note:  $\limsup$  and  $\liminf$  not covered this time.